UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
	X
YI SUN,	

Plaintiff,

#### **NOTICE OF REMOVAL**

-against-

19-CV-10858

HEATHER J. SASLOVSKY, ESQ. & MANHATTAN JUVENILE RIGHTS OFFICE OF THE LEGAL AID SOCIETY, MARGARET O'MARA, MS. TIFFANY SYLVESTRE, PHY. D., MANHATTAN FAMILY COURT, MR. CLARK RICHARDSON, MR. PHILIP SCHIFFE, ESQ., ZIWEI RAN; JOANN STROMAN & FORESTDALE, NEW YORK CITY ADMINISTRATION CHILDREN'S SERVICES, MS. **NICOLE** RICHARDS, MS. KATRINA GUERRERO, MS. KIRA LECZNAR, ESQ., MRS. FOSTER; MR. JESSE ALMONTE, MS. ZULMA MONTANEZ ET. AL., NEW YORK STATE CENTRAL REGISTER OF CHILD ABUSE AND MALTREATMENT, MR. RANTIDEVA SINGH, MS. MARYBETH S. ROCHROATH AND/OR QUEENS FAMILY COURT, MS. JOANN STROMAN, FORESTDALE, LI DA SUN, HUGH H. MO & THE LAW FIRM OF HUGH H. MO, P.C., TSAI CHUNG CHAO, M.D., MICHAEL A. SONKIN, MARTIN CLEARWATER BELL LLP, NEW YORK **CITY POLICE** DEPARTMENT, HAMILTON COLLEGE,

New York County Supreme Court Index No. 101501/2019

Defendants.

# TO THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK:

Defendants, the New York City Administration for Children's Services and the New York City Police Department, by their attorney, James E. Johnson, Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, in accordance with 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441 (a) and (c) and 1446, respectfully move in this Court as follows:

- 1. Plaintiff commenced the above-captioned action in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, on September 26, 2019 by filing a Summons and Complaint bearing Index No. 101501/2019. See Summons and Complaint annexed hereto as **EXHIBIT A**.
- 2. Plaintiff filed a Summons and Amended Complaint (hereinafter "Amended Complaint") on or about October 22, 2019. See Summons and Amended Complaint annexed hereto as **EXHIBIT B**.
- 3. On October 25, 2019, an envelope containing the Summons and Amended Complaint was received by mail at the New York City Police Department located at 1 Police Plaza, New York, New York 10007.
- 4. The within Notice of Removal is hereby filed within thirty (30) days of receipt of Plaintiff's Amended Complaint.
- 5. This action is removable to the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441 (a) and (c) because the Amended Complaint alleges that Plaintiff's rights were violated under 42 U.S.C. § 1983, First Amendment, Fourth, and Fourteenth Amendment of the United States Constitution (procedural and substantive due process violations alleged). See Exhibit B, p. 12 ¶ 21, p. 19 ¶ 10, p. 55.
- 6. This Court has original jurisdiction of the foregoing federal claim under the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 1331.
- 7. Upon information and belief, twenty of the twenty-two defendants in this action are in receipt of Plaintiff's Summons and Amended Complaint. Based upon the affidavits of service that have been filed with the New York County Supreme Court the following

defendants have not been sent and/or served with a copy of the Amended Complaint: (i) Ziwei Ran, (ii) Li Da Sun, (iii) Li Yao Sun, and (iii) Mrs. Foster.

8. The remaining defendants join in this request to remove this action from New York County Supreme Court to the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. Additionally, each defendant reserves the right to contest the adequacy of service of Plaintiff's Amended Complaint.

#### NOTICE OF RELATED PENDING ACTIONS

- 9. Plaintiff's Amended Complaint includes causes of action that span several decades and encompasses dozens of unrelated incidents. Nonetheless, Plaintiff has conceded that she has filed two prior federal actions arising out of some of the same incidents and occurrences. See Exhibit B, p. 17 ¶ 3. Plaintiff's prior federal actions were both commenced in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York bearing docket numbers 18-CV-11002 (LTS)(SN) and 19-CV-00017(ALC).
- 10. Plaintiff's first related federal action was commenced November 26, 2018. Yi Sun V. New York City Police Department, New York City Administration For Children's Services, Hugh H. Mo & The Law Firm Of Hugh H. Mo. P.C. 2019 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 181011 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2019). Currently, the defendants have fully dispositive motions to dismiss Plaintiff's complaint pending before the Honorable Laura T. Swain. Plaintiff has filed two appeals of orders issued by the Court to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit bearing docket numbers 19-1087 and 19-2459.
- 11. Plaintiff's second related federal action was commenced January 2, 2019. Yi Sun v. Anthony C. Ofodile, Esq and Ofodile & Associates, Appellate Division, First Judicial Department, Supreme Court of the State of New York, Carmen Victoria St-George, Part 34 of

New York Supreme Court, Charles L. Bardes, M.D. & Profess of Clinical Medicine, Weill Medical College, Det Maddy Acevedo & Manhattan Special Victims Squad of NYPD, Michael A. Sonkin and Martin Clearwater & Bell LLP, Hugh H. Mo, Office of Professional Medical Conduct, State of New York Department of Health, State of New York Commission on Judicial Conduct, Supreme Court of New York, New York County, Supreme Court, Appellate Division: First Judicial Department; Departmental Disciplinary Committee, Tsai Chung Chao, M.D. and Naturo-Medical Health Care, P.C., 2019 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 10256 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 19, 2019). By Order dated January 18, 2019, the Honorable Andrew L. Carter sua sponte dismissed Plaintiff's 93-page complaint. Plaintiff appealed this dismissal to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit. By Order dated August 16, 2019, Plaintiff's appeal was dismissed as it "lacks an arguable basis either in law or in fact." The Second Circuit further warned Plaintiff that "the continued filing of duplicative, vexatious, or clearly meritless appeals, motions, or other papers could result in the imposition of a sanction that would require Appellant to obtain permission from the Court prior to filing a further submission in this Court."

12. The allegations in Plaintiff's Amended Complaint involving the New York City Administration for Children's Services, New York City Police Department, The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C., and various employees/clients thereof are almost identical to the pending action before Judge Swain as both actions arise from the same transactions and events within the meaning of Rule 50.3.1 of the Southern District Rules for the Division of Business Among District Judges.

13. Similarly, the allegations in Plaintiff's Amended Complaint involving various Justices of the New York Supreme Court, state agencies, private entities, and various employees thereof are related to the action previously dismissed by Judge Carter. Therefore, this action

arises from the same transactions and events within the meaning of Rule 50.3.1 of the Southern

District Rules for the Division of Business Among District Judges

14. Notably, Plaintiff has also commenced prior actions in state court against

several of the named defendants. Many of these prior state court actions have been resolved

either by the trial court or the appellate division of the State of New York.

15. This office will promptly serve a copy of this Notice of Removal on Plaintiff,

and will file a copy of this Notice of Removal with the Clerk of the Supreme Court of the State

of New York, County of New York, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1446(d).

16. All defendants reserve all claims and defenses, including, without limitation,

those set forth in Rule 12(b) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

WHEREFORE, the New York City Administration for Children's Services and

the New York City Police Department respectfully request that the above-captioned action now

pending in the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of New York, be removed

therefrom to this Court.

Dated:

New York, New York

November 22, 2019

Yours,

**JAMES E. JOHNSON** 

Corporation Counsel

Attorney for City Defendants

100 Church Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

New York, New York 10007

t: (212) 356-3586

e: tridgew@law.nyc.gov

THAIS R. RIDGEWAY

Assistant Corporation Counsel

LETITIA JAMES	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP
Attorney General for the State of New York	Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office
Attorney for State Defendants	of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants
28 Liberty Street	420 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10005	Suite 219
t: (212) 416-8567	New York, New York 10170
e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	t: (516) 926-3396
Sel: Krody	e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN	GREGG D. WEINSTOCK
Assistant Attorney General	(§)
WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE	The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C.
Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes	Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh
407 East 61st Street	H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao
New York, New York 10065	225 Broadway, Suite 2702
t: (212) 746-0463	New York, New York 10007-3080
e: sho2003@med.corncll.edu	t: (212) 385-1500
	e: elmo@hbmolaw.com
SHERYL ORWEL	ELIZABETH L. MO
Associate University Counsel	
DOVID ACHODY POW A MINIO	B W CHAD HID
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP
Attorneys for Hamilton College	Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and
1 Lincoln Center	Michael A. Sonkin, Esq.
Syracuse, New York 13202-1355	61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, New York 10006
t: (315) 218-8120	t: (212) 867-4100
e: jfellows@bsk.com	e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
	G. CSKOCZENIZIKDIAW.COM
-	
JONATHAN FELLOWS	CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN

Attorney General for the State of New York  Attorney for State Defendants  28 Liberty Street  New York, New York 10005  t: (212) 416-8567 e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants 420 Lexington Avenue Suite 219 New York, New York 10170 t: (516) 926-3396 e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN	GREGG D. WHINSTOCK
Assistant Attorney General  WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE  Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes  407 East 61st Street  New York, New York 10065  1: (212) 746-0463  e: sho2003@med.cornell.edu	The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C.  Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao 225 Broadway, Suite 2702 New York, New York 10007- 3080 t: (212) 385-1500 e: elmo@hhmolaw.com
SHERYL ORWEL Associate University Counsel	ELIZABETH L. MO
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING Attorneys for Hamilton College 1 Lincoln Center Syracuse, New York 13202-1355 t: (315) 218-8120 e: jfellows@bsk.com	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and Michael A. Sonkin, Esq. 61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, New York 10006 t: (212) 867-4100 e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
JONATHAN FELLOWS	CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN

LETITIA JAMES Attorney General for the State of New York Attorney for State Defendants 28 Liberty Street New York, New York 10005 t: (212) 416-8567 e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants 420 Lexington Avenue Suite 219 New York, New York 10170 t: (516) 926-3396 e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN Assistant Attorney General	GREGG D. WEINSTOCK
WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes 407 East 61st Street New York, New York 10065 t: (212) 746-0463 e: sho2003@med.cornell.edu	The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C.  Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao 225 Broadway, Suite 2702  New York, New York 10007- 3080 t: (212) 385-1500 e: elmo@hhmolaw.com
SHERYL ORWEL Associate University Counsel	ELIZABETH L. MO
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING Attorneys for Hamilton College 1 Lincoln Center Syracuse, New York 13202-1355 t: (315) 218-8120 e: jfellows@bsk.com	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and Michael A. Sonkin, Esq. 61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, New York 10006 t: (212) 867-4100 e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
JONATHAN FELLOWS	CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN

LETITIA JAMES Attorney General for the State of New York Attorney for State Defendants 28 Liberty Street New York, New York 10005 t: (212) 416-8567 e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants 420 Lexington Avenue Suite 219 New York, New York 10170 t: (516) 926-3396 e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN Assistant Attorney General	GREGG D. WEINSTOCK
WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes 407 East 61st Street New York, New York 10065 t: (212) 746-0463 e: sho2003@med.comell.edu  SHERYL ORWEL Associate University Counsel	The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C.  Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao 225 Broadway, Suite 2702 New York, New York 10007-3080 t: (212) 385-1500 e: elmo@hhmolaw.com
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING Attorneys for Hamilton College 1 Lincoln Center Syracuse, New York 13202-1355 t: (315) 218-8120 e: jfellows@bsk.com	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and Michael A. Sonkin, Esq. 61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, New York 10006 t: (212) 867-4100 e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
JONATHAN FELLOWS	CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN

LETITIA JAMES	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP
Attorney General for the State of New York	Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office
Attorney for State Defendants	of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants
28 Liberty Street	420 Lexington Avenue
New York, New York 10005	Suite 219
t: (212) 416-8567	New York, New York 10170
e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	t: (516) 926-3396
c. Shart.Goodstem@ag.ny.gov	e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
	U. G. WOMBOOK BY YELL IN THE COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN	GREGG D. WEINSTOCK
Assistant Attorney General	
WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE	The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C.
Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes	Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh
407 East 61st Street	H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao
New York, New York 10065	225 Broadway, Suite 2702
t: (212) 746-0463	New York, New York 10007-3080
e: sho2003@med.cornell.edu	t: (212) 385-1500
o. Showoodaymediscinomeda	e: elmo@hhmolaw.com
<u> </u>	
SHERYL ORWEL	ELIZABETH L. MO
Associate University Counsel	
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP
Attorneys for Hamilton College	Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and
1 Lincoln Center	Michael A. Sonkin, Esq.
Syracuse, New York 13202-1355	61 Broadway, 26th Floor
t: (315) 218-8120	New York, New York 10006
e: jfellows@bsk.com	t: (212) 867-4100
	e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
1	
/ Hull	
JONATHAN FELLOWS	CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN

LETITIA JAMES Attorney General for the State of New York Attorney for State Defendants 28 Liberty Street New York, New York 10005 t: (212) 416-8567 e: Shari.Goodstein@ag.ny.gov	Vigorito, Barker, Patterson, Nichols & Porter, LLP Attorney for the Manhattan Juvenile Rights Office of the Legal Aid Society and Legal Aid Defendants 420 Lexington Avenue Suite 219 New York, New York 10170 t: (516) 926-3396 e: G.Weinstock@VBPNPLAW.COM
SHARI M. GOODSTEIN Assistant Attorney General WEILL CORNELL MEDICINE Attorney for Dr. Charles L. Bardes 407 East 61st Street New York, New York 10065 t: (212) 746-0463 e: sho2003@med.cornell.edu	GREGG D. WEINSTOCK  The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, P.C. Attorney for The Law Firm of Hugh H. Mo, Hugh H. Mo, and Dr. Tsai Chung Chao 225 Broadway, Suite 2702 New York, New York 10007- 3080 t: (212) 385-1500 e: elmo@hhmolaw.com
SHERYL ORWEL Associate University Counsel	ELIZABETH L. MO
BOND, SCHOENECK & KING Attorneys for Hamilton College 1 Lincoln Center Syracuse, New York 13202-1355 t: (315) 218-8120 e: jfellows@bsk.com	Furman Kornfeld & Brennan LLP Attorneys for Martin Clearwater & Bell and Michael A. Sonkin, Esq. 61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, New York 10006 t: (212) 867-4100 e: cskoczen@fkblaw.com
JONATHAN FELLOWS	/S/ Chistopher d. Skoczen* CHRISTOPHER D. SKOCZEN *consent by attached email

### Ridgeway, Thais (Law)

From:

Ridgeway, Thais (Law)

Sent:

Friday, November 22, 2019 5:27 PM

To:

'Christopher Skoczen, Esq.'

Cc:

Rachel Aghassi, Esq.

Subject:

RE: Signature/Consent | Yi Sun - Action Removal on Consent from NY County to SDNY

Thank you. This email is to confirm that I will be including your e-signature to consent to removal of this action.

Thais Ridgeway, Esq. Assistant Corporation Counsel General Litigation Division New York City Law Department 100 Church Street New York, New York 10007 Tel: (212) 356-3586

**CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:** This email message is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain **CONFIDENTIAL** or **PRIVILEGED** material or information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy the original message and any copies. If you are the intended recipient and do not wish to receive email communication from the sender, please advise the sender immediately.



please print email only when necessary

From: Christopher Skoczen, Esq. [mailto:cskoczen@fkblaw.com]

Sent: Friday, November 22, 2019 5:25 PM

**To:** Ridgeway, Thais (Law) **Cc:** Rachel Aghassi, Esq.

Subject: RE: Signature/Consent | Yi Sun - Action Removal on Consent from NY County to SDNY

Thanks Thais. Please use my e signature - /s/ Christopher D. Skoczen. Thanks for your help. Best, Chris



## Christopher Skoczen, Esq.

61 Broadway, 26th Floor New York, NY 10006 Tel 212-867-4100 Ext.363

Fax: 212-867-4118

cskoczen@fkblaw.com Bio www.fkblaw.com

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This email is intended only for the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering the message to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited, and you are requested to please notify us immediately by telephone, and return the original message to us at the above address. Thank you.

The Law Offices of Philip Schiff 260 Madison Avenue, Suite 204	FORESTDALE 67-35 112th Street
New York, NY 10016	Forest Hills, New York 11375
t: (914) 539-7136	t: (718) 263-0740
e:Philschiff@icloud.com	e: RTzimorotas@forestdaleinc.org
11/M/ 1/1/19	
D. PHILIP SCHIFF	RACHEL TZIMOROTAS

The Law Offices of Philip Schiff 260 Madison Avenue, Suite 204 New York, NY 10016

t: (914) 539-7136

e:Philschiff@icloud.com

FORESTDALE

67-35 112th Street

Forest Hills, New York 11375

t: (718) 263-0740

g. RTzimorotas@forestdaloinc org

D. PHILIP SCHIFF

RACHEL TZIMOROTAS

TO: Yi Sun

Plaintiff, *pro se* 10 East 116<sup>th</sup> Street, Apt #3A New York, New York 10029-1061 Email: sunyiculture@yahoo.com

BY FIRST-CLASS MAIL

CC: Clerk of the Court

Supreme Court of the State of New York

County of New York 60 Centre Street

New York, New York 10007

**BY HAND**